## APPENDIX I: TABLE A

**Table on the impact of spraying genetically modified plants with a glyphosate-based herbicide**

| Study | Compound | Result |
|---|---|---|
| Barbosa et al, (2012) **[SU/50]** | Protein: malondialdehyde, ascorbate peroxidase, glutathione reductase, and catalase | Elevated (seed) |
| | actin fragment, cytosolic glutamine synthetase, glycinin subunit G1, and glycine-rich RNA-binding protein | Expressed differently (seed) |
| Bellaloui et al, (2008) **[SU/51]** | Protein | Protein elevated (seed) |
| | Oil | Reduced (seed) |
| | Oleic acid | elevated (seed) |
| | Linolenic acid | Reduced (seed) |
| | nitrogen assimilation, as measured by in vivo nitrate reductase activity (NRA) in leaves, roots, and nodules | Reduced |
| Bellaloui et al, (2009a) **[SU/52]** | Protein | elevated (seed) |
| | Amino acids | elevated (not significant) (seed) |
| | Oil | Reduced (seed) |
| | Oleic acid | elevated (seed) |
| | Linolenic acid | Reduced (seed) |
| | Prolin | Elevated (seed) |
| | nitrate reductase activity (NRA) | Reduced |
| Bellaloui et al, (2009b) **[SU/53]** | Ferrum | Reduced (seed) |
| Bott et al, (2008) **[SU/54]** | root biomass and root elongation | depressions of plant growth in the GR soybean cultivar Valiosa strongly dependent on the selected culture conditions |
| | Shoot biomass | In soil culture, shoot biomass production declined by approximately 15–30% in glyphosate treated plants grown on an acidic Arenosol but not on a calcareous Loess sub-soil, while root biomass was not significantly affected |
| | nitrogen fixation | no effect of glyphosate application on nitrogen fixation as measured by acetylene reduction assay, soybean yield, or seed nitrogen content |

JKS

| Study | Compound | Result |
|---|---|---|
| Cavalieri et al, (2012) **[SU/4]** | effect of glyphosate formulations on nutrient accumulation and dry matter production on the shoot of two glyphosate-resistant (GR) soybean cultivars | Roundup Original®, Roundup Transorb® and Roundup WG® caused the greatest damage to nutrient accumulation and dry matter production. It was concluded that nutrient accumulation and dry matter production in the shoots of the soybean plants are affected by glyphosate application, even for GR cultivars. |
| Duke et al, (2003) **[SU/2]** | daidzein | Elevated (seed) |
| Duke et al, (2012) (review) **[SU/55]** | Plant mineral nutrition | Rigorous field studies on different soil types (including those highly susceptible to inducing Mn or Fe deficiency in soybeans) are needed to resolve the issue of whether glyphosate might have adverse effects on mineral nutrition of GR crops. |
| Reddy et al, (2000) **[SU/56]** | shoot and root dry weights | Reduced (greenhouse) |
| Reddy et al, (2003) **[SU/57]** | chlorophyll content, root and shoot dry weight, or nodule number | no effect |
| | nodule biomass | reduced by 21 to 28% 14 d LPOST<br>Soybean recovered by 14 d. |
| | Seed protein | Reduced when two applications were made (seed) |
| Reddy et al, (2004) **[SU/58]** | AMPA, Shikimate, glyphosate levels in plants | Chlorosis, effects measured till 22 DAT |
| Serra et al, (2011) **[SU/59]** Greenhouse | Mn | No effect<br>V8 (20 days after application) |
| | N, Mn, Cu, Zn and Fe | reduced |
| | Nodes | reduced |
| | Dry mass | reduced |
| Zablotowicz et al, (2007) **[SU/60]** | seed nitrogen | reduced, when high doses of glyphosate were applied (seed) |
| Zobiole et al, (2010a) **[SU/61]** | Number and weight of seeds per plant | reduced by 25% and 13% (seed) |
| | 17:1n-7 (not essentiell) | increased (by 30.3%) (seed) |
| | 18:1n-9 (not essentiell) | increased (by 25%) (seed) |
| | linoleic acid (18:2n-6) | Decrease (2.3%) (seed) |
| | linolenic acid (18:3n-3) | Decrease (9.6%) (seed) |
| Zobiole et al, (2010b) **[SU/62]** | Photosynthetic parameters | Decrease |
| | biomass production | Decrease |
| | water absorption | Decrease |
| | photosynthesis | Decrease |
| | water use efficiency | Decrease |
| Zobiole et al, (2010c) **[SU/63]** | Shoot and root dry biomass | Decrease |
| | Photosynthetic parameters | Decrease |
| | Micronutrients (Zn, Mn, Fe, Cu, B) in leaves | Decrease |
| | Macronutrients (N, P, K, Mg, Ca, S) | Decrease (but no effect on N) |

| Study | Compound | Result |
|---|---|---|
| Zobiole et al, (2010d) **[SU/64]** | photosynthetic parameters (A, SPAD, Fo, Fm) | Linear decrease<br><br>R1 growth stage<br><br>→ long-term physiological impacts |
| | Macronutrients (N, P, K, Mg, Ca, S) | Decrease: effects in the following order: Ca > Mg > nitrogen (N) > S > K > P |
| | Micronutrients (Fe, Co, Zn, Mn, Cu, Mo, B) | Effects of single application in the following order: Fe > Mn > cobalt (Co) > Zn > Cu > boron (B)> molybdenum (Mo)<br><br>two applications: Fe > Co > Zn > Mn > Cu > Mo > B |
| | shoot, root and total biomass dry weight | Reduced proportional to glyphosate dose. |
| Zobiole et al, (2010e) **[SU/65]** | photosynthetic rate | Severely decreased<br><br>RR2 more sensitive than RR1 |
| | Leaf area and shoot biomass production | Severely decreased<br><br>RR2 more sensitive than RR1 |
| Zobiole et al, (2010f) **[SU/66]** | photosynthetic rate | 1800 dose: reduction 33 and 31%. |
| | lignin and amino acid content | Reduced (linear) |
| | height and total (shoot and root) dry weight | Reduced (linear) |
| Zobiole et al, (2010g) **[SU/67]** | Nodule number | reduced |
| | Ni concentration | reduced |
| | Chlorophyll (SPAD units) | Lower in RR soybean<br><br>even lower when treated with glyphosate |
| | | Chlorotic symptoms, non persistent |
| Zobiole et al, (2010h) RR1 and RR2 **[SU/68]** | Fusarium spp. | Increased in RR1 and RR2 soybean |
| | Mn reducers /Mn oxidizers ratio | Decreased in RR1; The greatest reduction in the ratio of potential Mn reducers /Mn oxidizers occurred when glyphosate was applied at early (V2) compared with later growth stages (V4 and V6 |
| | root and shoot dry weight | Decreased in RR1 and RR2 soybean<br><br>Earlier glyphosate applications caused greater decreases in root dry weight<br>Shoot dry weight of both varieties was most reduced when glyphosate was applied at the V6 growth stage and least at V4 and V2 stages, with the GR2 cultivar affected more than the GR1 cultivar (Fig. 6). In general, GR2 produced less biomass (shoot and root) than GR1 when glyphosate was not applied |
| Zobiole et al, (2011) RR1 and RR2 **[SU/69]** | chlorophyll | decrease |

| Study | Compound | Result |
|---|---|---|
| | macro and micronutrient accumulation | Decrease<br>All macro- and micronutrients, with exception of N and K, accumulated more in RR1 than RR2 (Figs. 2 and 3 and Table 1). This result may be an individual cultivar characteristic, but it suggests that the RR2 cultivar was inefficient in nutrient uptake and translocation or was unable to rapidly recover from potential chelating effects of glyphosate<br><br>In the present experiment, glyphosate apparently remained active in soybean through R1 growth stage or later as indicated by decreased nutrient accumulation. It is known that glyphosate and its metabolites can remain within the plant until complete physiological maturity. |
| | Nodule dry weight and number | Reduced tendency for late applications to have less effect than early applications |
| | Shoot biomass | decrease<br>higher percent reduction associated with late than with early glyphosate applications |
| | chlorosis | The new generation RR soybeans also showed undesirable glyphosate effects as "yellow flashing". |
| Zobiole et al, (2012) RR2 **[SU/70]** | photosynthetic rate | severely depressed |
| | macro- and micronutrient accumulations | Proportionally reduced as glyphosate rates increased and applications were delayed<br><br>Macronutrient and all micronutrient concentrations except Cu were within the nutrient-sufficiency ranges for soybean<br><br>Concentrations of Ca, Mg, S, and Cu were significantly ($p$ < 5%) lower in glyphosate-treated soybean yet all values were within the sufficiency ranges for those nutrient concentrations to provide acceptable soybean growth. Concentrations of P and Fe appeared to be increased by glyphosate. |
| | nodule number and dry weight | significantly decreased<br><br>In contrast with other results, a tendency was noted for reduced effects at late applications compared with early applications |
| | root dry weight | more severely depressed with glyphosate applied at V2 growth stage compared with V6 growth stage |
| | leaf area and shoot dry weight | More strongly decreased at the late growth stage than at the early stage |

## APPENDIX II – TABLE B

**Table B: Summary of scientific literature showing the numerous plant constituents and chemicals which can have synergistic or combinatorial effects with the inserted Cry proteins/Bt toxins.**

| **Publication** | **toxin** | **Factors which inflluence activity of Bt toxins** | **Impact on toxicty** | **Impact on selectivity (decrease in selectivity means risks for non-target organisms are enhanced)** |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Broderick et al, (2003) **[SU/71]** | Bt-toxins | Antibioticum Zwittermicin | + | ? |
| Broderick et al. (2006 **[SU/11]**, 2009) | Cry1Ab | Microorganisms are part of toxic effects in the gut | + | ? |
| Dubois and Dean (1995) **[SU/72]** | Cry1Ab | Several bacteria Spores from bacteria | + | ? |
| Hamshou et al, (2009) **[SU/73]** | Cry-Toxin | Lectines produced by solanaceae | + | ? |
| Huang et al, (2002) **[SU/74]** | Cry1Ab | Activation of toxins by transferring it into plants | + | ? |
| Khalique & Ahmed, (2005) **[SU/75]** | Bt-toxins | pyrethroids | + | ? |
| **Kramarz et al, (2007) [SU/76]** | **Cry1Ab** | **cadmium and infestations with nematodes in snails** | + | - |
| **Kramarz et al. 2009 [SU/47]** | **Cry1Ab** | **infestation with nematodes in snails** | + | - |

| **Publication** | **toxin** | **Factors which inflluence activity of Bt toxins** | **Impact on toxicty** | **Impact on selectivity (decrease in selectivity means risks for non-target organisms are enhanced)** |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Lee et al, (1996) **[SU/15]** | Cry1Ab | synergistic effects with other Cry toxins | + - | ? |
| Lopez et al, (2010) **[SU/78]** | Cry1Ab | infestation with nosema (in resistant caterpillars) | + | ? |
| **MacIntosh et al, (1990) [SU/79]** | **Cry1Ab** | **Protease inhibitors from plants** | + | **?** |
| Mason et al, (2011) **[SU/13]** | Cry1Ac | (non pathogenic) bacteria in the gut | + | ? |
| **Pardo-López et al, (2009) (review) [SU/17]** | **Cry1Ab and others** | **Protease Inhibitors, chitinase, Cyt Toxine, cadherin peptides** | + | **?** |
| Saleem et al, (1995) **[SU/80]** | Bt-toxins | pyrethroids | + | ? |
| Soberon et al, (2009) **[SU/10]** | Cry1Ab | Activation by genetic engineering | + | ? |
| **Sharma et al, (2004) [SU/81]** | **Cry1Ab** | **Synergies with other Cry toxins and protease-Inhibitors** | **+ -** | **?** |
| **Thomas & Ellar, (1983) [SU/38]** | **Cry-toxins** | **Solubilized toxins administered via blood system (mammal)** | + | + |
| **Zhang et al, (2000) [SU/82]** | **Cry-Toxine** | **Soybean trypsin inhibitor** | + | **?** |
| Zhu et al, (2005) **[SU/83]** | Cry1Ac | Avidin | + | ? |

## APPENDIX III - APPENDED DOCUMENTS

### PROCEDURAL DOCUMENTS ("PD")

| TAB | DOCUMENT |
|---|---|
| 1. | Monsanto Application EFSA-GMO-NL-2009-73 seeking authorisation of MON 87701 x MON 89788 for food and feed uses, import and processing under Regulation (EC) No 1829/2003: Part 2 (Summary) |
| 2. | Opinions and Comments of the Member States |
| 3. | Scientific Opinion on application (EFSA-GMO-NL-2009-73) for the placing on the market of insect-resistant and herbicide-tolerant genetically modified soybean MON 87701 x MON 89788 for food and feed uses, import and processing under Regulation (EC) No 1829/2003 from Monsanto (**"the EFSA Opinion"**) |
| 4. | Report of the meeting of the Standing Committee on the Food Chain and Animal Health held on 2 May 2012 |
| 5. | Commission Implementing Decision of 28 June 2012 authorising the placing on the market of products containing, consisting of, or produced from genetically modified soybean MON 87701 × MON 89788 (MON-877Ø1-2 × MON-89788-1) pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 1829/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council (2012/347/EU) |
| 6. | Testbiotech Request for internal Review sent on 6 August 2012 (**"Request for Internal Review"**) and Covering letter |
| 7. | European Commission Decision letter dated 8 January 2013 refusing Testbiotech's Request for Review of Commission Decision 2012/347 (**"the Commission Decision"**) |
| 8. | Commission Implementing Decision of 10 February 2012 authorising the placing on the market of products containing, consisting of, or produced from genetically modified soybean MON 87701 (MON-877Ø1-2) pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 1829/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council (2012/83/EU) |
| 9. | Commission Decision of 4 December 2008 authorising the placing on the market of products containing, consisting of, or produced from genetically modified soybean MON89788 (MON-89788-1) pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 1829/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council (2008/933/EC) |
| 10. | The Commission Decision as provided to ENSSER |
| 11. | Sambucus' Cover Letter and Request for Internal Review |
| 12. | The Commission Decision as provided to Sambucus |
| 13. | TestBiotech Registration Document |
| 14. | Testbiotech Statute/Articles of Association |
| 15. | ENSSER's Statute/Articles of Association |
| 16. | ENSSER's covering letter for the Request for Internal Review. |
| 17. | Sambucus' Statute/Articles of Association |
| 18. | ENSSER's Registration Document |
| 19. | Sambucus' Registration Document |

**SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS ("SU")**

| TAB | DOCUMENT |
|---|---|
| 1. | Monsanto Application EFSA-GMO-NL-2009-73 seeking authorisation of MON 87701 x MON 89788 for food and feed uses, import and processing under Regulation (EC) No 1829/2003: Part 1 – (**"the Technical Dossier"**) |
| 2. | *"Isoflavone, Glyphosate, and Aminomethylphosphonic Acid Levels in Seeds of Glyphosate-Treated, Glyphosate-Resistant Soybean"*, S. Duke, A. Rimando, P. Pace, K. Reddy, and R.J. Smeda, J. Agric. Food Chem 2003, 51, 340 -344 (**"Duke et al (2003)"**) |
| 3. | *"Effects of Soy Phytoestrogens Genistein and Daidzein on Breast Cancer Growth"* M.L. De Lemos, The Annals of Pharmacotherapy, 2001 September, Volume 35, (**"De Lemos (2001)"**) |
| 4. | *"Acumlo de Nutrientes e Matéria seca na Parte Aérea de Dois Cultivares de Soja RR Sob Efeito de Formulacoes de Glyphosate - Nutrient and Shoot Dry Matter Accumulation of Two GR Soybean Cultivars under the Effect of Glyphosate Formulations"* Cavalieri, Velini, Sã José, e Andrade, Planta Daninha, Viçosa-MG, v. 30, n. 2, p. 349-358, 2012 (Only summary provided as publication is only available in Spanish) (**"Calalieri et al, (2012)"**) |
| 5. | *"Toxic Secondary Metabolite Production in Genetically Modified Potatoes in Response to Stress,"* Derek Matthews, Huw Hones, Paul Gans, Steven Coates and Lydia M.J. Smith, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry (**"Matthews et al, (2005)"**) |
| 6. | *"Proteomics as a Complementary Tool for Identifying Unintended Side Effects Occurring in Transgenic Maize Seeds As a Result of Genetic Modifications"* Lello Zolla, Sara Rinalducci, Paolo Antonioli, and Pier Giorgio Righetti (2007), Journal of Proteome Research (**"Zolla et al (2008)"**) |
| 7. | *"A simple question in a complex environment: How much Bt toxin do genetically engineered MON810 maize plants actually produce?"* Breckling, B., Reuter, H. & Verhoeven, R. (2008) Implications of GM-Crop Cultivation at Large Spatial Scales. Theorie in der Ökologie 14. Frankfurt, Peter Lang, C. Then & A. Lorch, (**"Then & Lorch, (2008)"**) |
| 8. | *"Transgene x Environment Interactions in Genetically Modified Wheat,"* Zeller SL, Kalinina O, Brunner S, Keller B, Schmid B (2010), PLoS ONE 5(7): e11405. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0011405 (**"Zeller et al, (2010)"**) |
| 9. | *"A mechanism of cell death involving an adenylyl cyclasePKA signaling pathway is induced by the Cry1Ab toxin of Bacillus thuringiensis"*, Xuebin Zhang, Mehmet Candas, Natalya B. Griko, Ronald Taussig, and Lee A. Bulla, Jr, (2006) www.pnas.org_cgi_doi_10.1073_pnas.0604017103 (**"Zhang et al, (2006)"**) |
| 10. | *"Signaling versus punching hole: How do Bacillus thuringiensis toxins kill insect midgut cells?"* M. Soberon, S.S. Gill and A. Bravo, Cell. Mol. LifeSci. (2009) 1337-1349 (**"Soberon, et al (2009)"**) |
| 11. | *"Midgut bacteria required for Bacillus thuringiensis insecticidal activity"*, Nichole A. Broderick, Kenneth F. Raffa, and Jo Handelsman, PNAS 2006;103;15196-15199 (**"Broderick et al, (2006)"**) |
| 12. | *"Gut Bacteria Are Not Required for the Insecticidal Activity of Bacillus thuringiensis toward the Tobacco Hornworm, Manduca sexta"*, Paul R. Johnston and Neil Crickmore, Applied and Environmental Microbiology, Aug. 2009, p. 5094–5099 Vol. 75, No. 15 (**"Johnston & Crickmore, (2009)"**) |
| 13. | *"From Commensal to Pathogen: Translocation of Enterococcus faecalis from the Midgut to the Hemocoel of Manduca sexta"*, Katie L. Mason, Taylor A. Stepien, Jessamina E. Blum, Jonathan F. Holt, Normand H. Labbe, Jason S. Rush,a Kenneth F. Raffa, and Jo Handelsmana, mBio 2(3):e00065-11. doi:10.1128/mBio.00065-11. |

| | |
|---|---|
| | (**"Mason et al, (2011)**") |
| 14. | *"Bacillus thuringiensis Cry1Ab Mutants Affecting Oligomer Formation Are Non-toxic to Manduca sexta Larvae"* Nuria Jimenez-Juarez, Carlos Munoz-Garay, Isabel Gomez, Gloria Saab-Rincon, Juanita Y. Damian-Almazo, Sarjeet S. Gill, Mario Soberon, and Alejandra Bravo, the Jounral of Biological Chemistry Vol. 282, NO.29, pp. 21222-21229, July 20, 2007, (**"Jiminez-Juares (2007)**") |
| 15. | *"Synergistic Effect of the Bacillus thuringiensis Toxins CryIAa and CryIAc on the Gypsy Moth, Lymantria dispar",* M. Kyong Lee, A. Curtiss, E. Alcantara and D. H. dean, Applied and Envionrmental Microbiology, Feb. 1996, p. 583–586 (**"Lee et al, (1996)**") |
| 16. | *"Synergistic activity between Bacillus thuringiensis Cry1Ab and Cry1Ac toxins against maize stem borer (Chilo partellus Swinhoe)",* P. Sharma, V. Nain, S. Lakhanpaul and P.A. Kumar, The Society for Applied Microbiology, Letters in Applied Microbiology 51 (2010) 42–47 (**"Sharma et al, (2010)**") |
| 17. | *"Strategies to improve the insecticidal activity of Cry toxins from Bacillus thuringiensis"* L. Pardo-Lo´ pez, C. Munoz-Garay, H. Porta, C. Rodriguez-Almaza´ n, M. Sobero´ n, A. Bravo, Elsevier (2009) (**"Pardo-Lopez et al, (2009)**") |
| 18. | *"Quantification of Bacillus thuringiensis Cry1Ab protein in tissues of YieldGard (MON810) corn hybrids tested at multiple field locations in India",* S.P. Kamath, S. Anuradha, H.S. Vidya, K.S. Mohan, Yelena Dudin, Elsevier (2010) (**"Kamath et al, (2010))** |
| 19. | *"Risk assessment of GM stacked events obtained from crosses between GM events",* A. De Schrijver, Y. Devos, M. Van den Bulcke, P. Cadot, M. De Loose, D. Reheul and M. Sneyers, (2006) Trends in Food Science & Technology xx (2006) 1e9 Elsevier (**"De Schrijver et al, (2006))** |
| 20. | *"Glyphosate Formulations Induce Apoptosis and Necrosis in Human Umbilical, Embryonic, and Placental Cells",* Nora Benachour and Gilles-Eric Séralini, Chem. Res. Toxicol. 2009, 22, 97–105 (**"Benachour et al, (2009)**") |
| 21. | *"Glyphosate-Based Herbicides Produce Teratogenic Effects on Vertebrates by Impairing Retinoic Acid Signaling"* Alejandra Paganelli, Victoria Gnazzo, Helena Acosta, Silvia L. Lopez and Andrés E. Carrasco, ACS Publications, (2010) (**"Paganelli et al, (2010)**") (Only access to Summary) |
| 22. | *"Ultrastructural Morphometrical and Immunocytochemical Analyses of Hepatocyte Nuclei from Mice Fed on Genetically Modified Soybean",* M. Malatesta, C Caporaloni, S. Gavaudan, M.B.L. Rocchi, S. Serafini, C. Tiberi, and G. Gazzanelli, Cell Structure and Function, 27: 173-180 (2002) (**"Malatesta et al, (2002)**") |
| 23. | *"Reversibility of hepatocyte nuclear modifications in mice fed on genetically modified soybean",* M. Malatesta, C. Tiberi, B. Baldelli, S. Battistelli, E. Manuali, M. Biggiogera, European Journal of Histochemistry (2005) (**"Malatesta et al, (2005)**") |
| 24. | *"Hepatoma tissue culture (HTC) cells as a model for investigating the effects of low concentrations of herbicide on cell structure and function",* M. Malatesta, F. Perdoni, G. Santin, S. Battistelli, S. Muller, and M. Biggiogera, Toxicology in Vitro, (2008) 1853-1860, Elsevier, (**"Malatesta et al, (2008)**") |
| 25. | *"Can a genetically-modified organism-containing diet influence embryo development? A preliminary study on pre-implantation mouse embryos",* B. Cisterna, F. Flach, L. Vecchio, S.M.L. Barabino, S. Battistelli, T.E. Martin, M. Malatesta, M. Biggiogera, European Journal of Histochemistry, 2008; vol.52 issue 4(October-December): 263-267(**"Cisterna et al, (2008)**") |
| 26. | *"The Effect of Glyphosate on Potential Pathogens and Beneficial Members of Poultry Microbiota In Vitro",* Awad A. Shehata, Wieland Schrodl, Alaa. A. AldinHafez M. Hafez · Monika Krüger, Springer, (2012) (**"Shehata et al, (2012))** |
| 27. | *"Glyphosate suppresses the antagonistic effect of Enterococcus spp. on Clostridium* |

| | |
|---|---|
| | *Botulinum"* M. Krüger, A.A. Shehata, W. Schrőder, A. Rodloff, Elsevier, 2013, ("**Shehata et al, (2013)**") |
| 28. | *"Mode of Action of Herbicidal Derivatives of Aminomethylenebisphosphonic Acid. Part II. Reversal of Herbicidal Action by Aromatic Amino Acids",* G. Forlani, P. Kafarski, B. Lejczak, and P. Wieczorek, **("Forlani et al, (1997)")** |
| 29. | *"Glyphosate in the Environment",* S.M. Carlisle and J. T. Trevors, Water, Air, and Soil Pollution 39 (1988) 409-420, ("**Carlisle & Trevors (1988)**") |
| 30. | *"The effect of glyphosate on digestion and horizontal gene transfer during in vitro ruminal fermentation of genetically modified canola",* T. Reuter, T.W. Alexander, T. Martinez, and T. McAllister, Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture, J Sci Food Agric 87:2837-2843 (2007) ("**Reuter et al, (2007)**") |
| 31. | Letter from EFSA dated 2011 which deals with a *"Request for advice from DG Sanco to analyse the article on residues associated with GMO/maternal and fetal exposure in relation to a previous EFSA statement from 2007 as well as statements given during the GMO debate in January 2011 at the European Parliament by Mr. Seralini, and the ongoing public debate in general."* (**"the DG Sanco Letter"**) |
| 32. | *"Glyphosate-based herbicides are toxic and endocrine disruptors in human cell lines",* Céline Gasniera, Coralie Dumontb, Nora Benachoura, Emilie Clair a, Marie-Christine Chagnonb, Gilles-Eric Séralini, Elsevier (2009) ("**Gasniera et al, (2009)**") |
| 33. | *"Detection of transgenic DNA in tilapias (Oreochromis niloticus, GIFT strain) fed genetically modified soybeans (Roundup Ready)",* Tao Ran, Liu Mei,Wang Lei, Liu Aihua, He Ru & Sun Jie, Aquaculture Research, 2009, 40, 1350^1357 ("**Ran et al, (2009)**") |
| 34. | *"Fate of transgenic DNA and evaluation of metabolic effects in goats fed genetically modified soybean and in their offsprings",* R. Tudisco, V. Mastellone, M. I. Cutrignelli, P. Lombardi-, F. Bovera, N. Mirabella, G. Piccolo, S. Calabro`, L. Avallone and F. Infascelli, Animal, (2010) ("**Tudisco et al, (2010)**") |
| 35. | *"Exogenous plant MIR168a specifically targets mammalian LDLRAP1: evidence of cross-kingdom regulation by microRNA",* Lin Zhang, Dongxia Hou, Xi Chen, Donghai Li, Lingyun Zhu, Yujing Zhang, Jing Li, Zhen Bian, Xiangying Liang, Xing Cai, Yuan Yin, Cheng Wang, Tianfu Zhang, Dihan Zhu, Dianmu Zhang, Jie Xu, Qun Chen, Yi Ba, Jing Liu, Qiang Wang, Jianqun Chen, Jin Wang, Meng Wang, Qipeng Zhang, Junfeng Zhang, Ke Zen1, Chen-Yu Zhang, Cell Research (2011) :1-20. ("**Zhang et al, (2011))** |
| 36. | *"A Bacillus thuringiensis Crystal Protein with Selective Cytocidal Action to Human Cells",* Akio Ito, Yasuyuki Sasaguri, Sakae Kitada, Yoshitomo Kusaka, Kyoko Kuwano, Kenjiro Masutomi, Eiichi Mizuki, Tetsuyuki Akao, and Michio Ohba, Published, JBC Papers in Press, March 16, 2004, DOI 10.1074/jbc.M401881200 ("**Ito et al, (2004)**") |
| 37. | *"Mitogen-activated protein kinase pathways defend against bacterial pore-forming toxins",* Danielle L. Huffman, Laurence Abrami, Roman Sasik, Jacques Corbeil, F. Gisou van der Goot, and Raffi V. Aroian, PNAS July 27, 2004, vol. 101 no. 30 10995–11000 ("**Huffman et al, (2004)**") |
| 38. | *"Bacillus Thuringiensis var Israelensis Crystal ϱ-Endotoxin: Effects on Insect and Mammalian Cells in vitro and in vivo",* W.E. Thomas, D. J. Ellar J. Cell Sci. 60, 181-197 (1983) ("**Thomas & Ellar, (1983)**") |
| 39. | *"BT BRINJAL Event EE1The Scope and Adequacy of the GEAC Toxicological Risk Assessment Review of Oral Toxicity Studies in Rats",* November 14, 2010, Dr Lou M Gallagher ("**Gallagher, (2010)**") |
| 40. | *"Cytotoxicity on human cells of Cry1Ab and Cry1Ac Bt insecticidal toxins alone or with a glyphosate-based herbicide",* R. Mesnage, E. Clair, S. Gress, C. Then, A. Székács and G.-E. Séralinia, Journal of Applied Toxicology, (wileyonlinelibrary.com) DOI 10.1002/jat.2712 ("**Mesnage et al, (2012)**") |

| | |
|---|---|
| 41. | Letter from the Commission to Mr C. Then dated 11 November 2011, appending a letter from EFSA to the Commission in relation an application for authorisation of a genetically modified maize (“**the Maize Letter**”) |
| 42. | *“The impact of altered herbicide residues in transgenic herbicide-resistant crops on standard setting for herbicide residues”,* Gijs A Kleter, John B Unsworth and Caroline A Harris, Sci, (wileyonlinelibrary.com) DOI 10.1002/ps.2128, (2011) (“**Kleter et al, (2011)**”) |
| 43. | *“Evaluation of stress- and immune-response biomarkers in Atlantic salmon, Salmo salar L., fed different levels of genetically modified maize (Bt maize), compared with its near-isogenic parental line and a commercial suprex maize”,* A Sagstad, M Sanden, Ø Haugland, A-C Hansen, P A Olsvik and G-I Hemre, Journal of Fish Diseases 2007, 30, 201–212, (“**Sagstad et al, (2007)**”) |
| 44. | *“Effects of Feeding Bt MON810 Maize to Pigs for 110 Days on Peripheral Immune Response and Digestive Fate of the cry1Ab Gene and Truncated Bt Toxin”,* Maria C. Walsh, Stefan G. Buzoianu, Mary C. Rea,, Orla O’Donovan, Eva Gelencse´, Gabriella Ujhelyi, R. Paul Ross, Gillian E. Gardiner, Peadar G. Lawlor, Plos One, (2012) (“**Walsh et al, (2012)**) |
| 45. | *“Intestinal and Peripheral Immune Response to MON810 Maize Ingestion in Weaning and Old Mice”,* A. Finamore, M. Roselli, S. Britti, G. Monastra, R. Ambra, A. Turrini, E. Mengheri, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry (2008) (“**Finamore et al, (2008)**”) |
| 46. | *“Immunotoxicological studies of genetically modified rice expressing PHA-E lectin or Bt toxin in Wistar rats”,* Kroghsbo S, Madsen C, Poulsen M, Schrøder M, Kvist PH, Taylor M, Gatehouse A, Shu Q, Knudsen I., U.S. National Library of Medicin, Toxicology. 2008 Mar 12;245(1-2):24-34. Epub 2007 Dec 17, (“**Kroghsbo et al (2008)**”) |
| 47. | *“Increased response to cadmium and Bacillus Thuringiensis Maize toxicity in the snail helix aspersa infected by the nematode phasmarhabiditis hermaphrodita”* P. Kramarz, A. de Vaufleury, P.M.S. Zygmunt, and C. Verdun, Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, Vol. 26, No. 1, pp. 73–79, 2007 (“**Kramarz et al, (2009)**”) |
| 48. | *“Pancreatic response of rats fed genetically modified soybean”*, J.A. Magana-Gomez, G.L. Cervantes, G. Yepiz-Plascenia and A.M. Calderon de la Barca, Journal of Applied Toxicology, J. Appl. Toxicol. 2008; 28: 217-226, (“**Magana-Gomez et al, (2008)**”) |
| 49. | *“Glyphosate”,* Pesticide Action Network Asia & the Pacific, PANAP, November 2009, (“**PANAP (2009)**”) |
| 50. | *“New insights on proteomics of transgenic soybean seeds: evaluation of differential expressions of enzymes and proteins”*, H. S. Barbosa, S. C. C. Arruda, R. A. Azevedo & M. A. Z. Arruda, Anal Bioanal Chem (2012) 402:299–314 (“**Barbosa et al, (2012)**”) |
| 51. | *“Nitrogen Metabolism and Seed Composition As Influenced by Glyphosate Application in Glyphosate-Resistant Soybean”,* N. Bellaloui, R.M. Zablotowicz, K.N. Reddy and C.A. Abel, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2008,** *56,* 2765–2772 **2765** (“**Bellaloui et al, (2008)**”) |
| 52. | *“Effect of Glyphosate-Boron Application on Seed Composition and Nitrogen Metabolism in Glyphosate-Resistant Soybean”,* N. Bellaloui, H.K. Abbas, A.M. Gillen and C.A. Abel, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, J. Agric. Food Chem. 2009, 57, 9050–9056 (“**Bellalui et al, (2009a)**”) |
| 53. | *“Effects of Glyphosate Application on Seed Iron and Root Ferric (III) Reductase in Soybean Cultivars”,* N. Bellaloui, R.M. Zablotowicz, K.N. Reddy and C.A. Abel, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, J. Agric. Food Chem. 2009, 57, 9569–9574 (“**Bellaloui et al, (2009b)**”) |
| 54. | *“Glyphosate-induced impairment of plant growth and micronutrient status in* |

| | |
|---|---|
| | *glyphosate-resistant soybean (Glycine max L.)"*, Sebastian Bott, Tsehaye Tesfamariam, Hande Candan, Ismail Cakmak, Volker Römheld & Günter Neumann, Plant Soil (2008) 312:185–194 ("**Bott et al, (2008)**") |
| 55. | *"Glyphosate Effects on Plant Mineral Nutrition, Crop Rhizosphere Microbiota, and Plant Disease in Glyphosate-Resistant Crops"* S. Duke, J. Lydon, W.C. Koskinen, T.B. Moorman, R.L.Chaney, and R. Hammerschmidt, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, (review) pubs.acs.org/JAFC ("**Duke et al, (2012)**") |
| 56. | *"Effect of Glyphosate on Growth, Chlorophyll, and Nodulation in Glyphosate-Resistant and Susceptible Soybean (Glycine max) Varieties"*, K. N. Reddy, R.E. Hoagland, R.M. Zablowitcz, Journal of New Seeds, Vol.2(3) 2000 ("**Reddy et al, (2000)**") |
| 57. | *"Glyphosate-resistant soybean response to various salts of glyphosate and glyphosate accumulation in soybean nodules"*, K. N. Reddy and R. M. Zablotowica, Weed Science, 51(4):496-502. 2003 ("**Reddy et al, (2003)**") |
| 58. | *"Aminomethylphosphonic Acid, a Metabolite of Glyphosate,Causes Injury in Glyphosate-Treated, Glyphosate-Resistant Soybean"*, K. R. Reddy, N. Reddy, A.M. Rimando and S.O. Duke, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 2004, *52,* 5139-5143 5139 ("**Reddy et al, (2004)**") |
| 59. | *"Glyphosate influence on nitrogen, manganese, iron, copper and zinc nutritional efficiency in glyphosate resistant soybean"*, A. P. Serra, M.E. Marchetti, A.C. da Silva Candido, A.C. Ribeiro Dias, P.J. Christoffoleti, Ciência Rural, Santa Maria, v.41, n.1, p.77-84, jan, 2011 ("**Serra et al, (2011)**") |
| 60. | *"Nitrogenase activity, nitrogen content, and yield responses to glyphosate in glyphosate-resistant soybean"* R.M. Zablotowicz, K.N. Reddy Crop Protection 26 (2007) 370–376, Elsevier ("**Zablotowicz et al, (2007)**") |
| 61. | *"Glyphosate Affects Seed Composition in Glyphosate-Resistant Soybean*", L. H. S. Zobiole, R. S. de Oliveira, JR, V. Visentainer, R. J. Kremer, N. Bellaloui, and T. Yamada, Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, J. Agric. Food Chem. 2010, 58, 4517–4522 ("**Zobiole et al, (2010a)**") |
| 62. | *"Water use efficiency and photosynthesis of glyphosate-resistant soybean as affected by glyphosate"*, L.H. S. Zobiole, R.S. de Oliveira JR, R. J. Kremer, J. Constantin, C. M. Bonato, A. S. Muniz, ("**Zobiole et al, (2010b)**") |
| 63. | *"Glyphosate reduces shoot concentrations of mineral nutrients in glyphosate-resistant soybeans Zobiole et al"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. S. de Oliveira, JR, D.M. Huber, J. Constantin, C. de Castro, F.A. de Oliveira, A. de Oliveira Jr, Plant Soil (2010) 328:57–69 ("**Zobiole et al (2010c)**") |
| 64. | *"Nutrient Accumulation and Photosynthesis in Glyphosate Resistant Soybeans is Reduced under Glyphosate Use"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. S. de Oliveira, JR, R. J. Kremer, A.S. Muniz, A. de Oliveira Jr, Journal of Plant Nutrition, 33:1860–1873, 2010 ("**Zobiole et al, (2010d)**") |
| 65. | *"Glyphosate affects photosynthesis in first and second generation of glyphosate-resistant soybeans"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. J. Kremer, R. S. de Oliveira JR, and J. Constantin, Springer, 2010, ("**Zobiole et al, (2010e)**") |
| 66. | *"Glyphosate affects lignin content and amino acid production in glyphosate-resistant soybean"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, E. A. P. Bonini, R. S. de Oliveira JR, R. J. Kremer, O. Ferrarese-Filho, Acta Physiol Plant (2010) 32:831–837, ("**Zobiole et al, (2010f)**"), |
| 67. | *"Effect of glyphosate on symbiotic N2 fixation and nickel concentration in glyphosate-resistant soybeans"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. J. Kremer, R. S. de Oliveira JR, J. Constantin, T. Yamada, C. Castro, F. A. Oliveira, J. Constantin, Applied Soil Ecology 44 (2010) 176–180, Elsevier ("**Zobiole et al, (2010g)**") |
| 68. | *"Glyphosate affects micro-organisms in rhizospheres of glyphosate-resistant soybeans"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. J. Kremer, R. S. de Oliveira JR, J. Constantin, Journal of Applied Microbiology ISSN 1364-5072 ("**Zobiole et al, (2010h)**") |

| | |
|---|---|
| 69. | *"Glyphosate affects chlorophyll, nodulation and nutrient accumulation of "second generation" glyphosate-resistant soybean"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. J. Kremer, R. S. de Oliveira JR, J. Constantin, Pesticide Biochemistry and Physiology 99 (2011) 53–60 (Glycine max L.) ("**Zobiole et al, (2011)**") |
| 70. | *"Glyphosate effects on photosynthesis, nutrient accumulation, and nodulation in glyphosate-resistant soybean"*, L. H. S. Zobiole, R. J. Kremer, R. S. de Oliveira JR, J. Constantin, J. Plant Nutr. Soil Sci. 2012, 000, 1–12 ("**Zobiole et al, (2012)**") |
| 71. | *"Effect of Host Diet and Insect Source on Synergy of Gypsy Moth (Lepidoptera: Lymantriidae) Mortality to Bacillus thuringiensis subsp. kurstaki by Zwittermicin A"*, N. A. Broderick, R. M. Goodman, J. Handelsman, & K. F. Raffa ("**Broderick et al, (2003)**") |
| 72. | *"Synergism Between CryIA Insecticidal Crystal Proteins and Sports of Bacillus thuringiensis, Other Bacterial Spores, and Vegetative Cells Against Lymantria dispar (Lepidoptera: Lymantriidae) Larvae"*, N. R. Dubois and D.H. Dean, Environ. Entomol. 24(6): 17451-1747 (1995)("**Dubois and Dean, (1995)**") |
| 73. | *"Entomotoxic effects of fungal lectin from Rhizoctonia solani towards Spodoptera littoralis"*, M. Hamshou, E. J. M. Van Damme, and G. Smagghe, Fungal Biology Volume 114, Issue 1, January 2010, Pages 34-40 (Abstract Only) ("**Hamshou et al, (2009)**") |
| 74. | *"Survival of Kansas Dipel-Resistant European Corn Borer (Lepidoptera: Crambidae) on Bt and Non-Bt Corn Hybrids"*, F. Huang, L. Lawrent, L. Buschman, R. A. Higgins, and L. Huarong, Journal of Economic Entomology, 95(3):614-621. 2002 ("**Huang et al, (2002)**") |
| 75. | *"Compatibility of Bio-insecticide with Chemical Insecticide for Management of Helicoverpa armigera Huebner"*, F. Khalique and K. Ahmed, Pakistan Journal of Biological Science 8(3): 475-478, 2005 ( ("**Khalique & Ahmed, (2005)**") |
| 76. | *"Increased Response to Cadmium and Bacillus Thuringiensis Maize Toxicity in the Snail Helis Aspersa Infected by the Nematode Phasmarhabditis Hermaphrodita"*, P. E. Kramarz, A. de Vaufleury, P. M. S. Zygmunt and C. Verdun, Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, Vol. 26, No. 1, pp. 73–79, 2007 ("**Kramarz et al, (2007)**") |
| 77. | *"Contributions of gut bacteria to Bacillus thuringiensis-induced mortality vary across a range of Lepidoptera"*, Nichole A Broderick, Courtney J Robinson, Matthew D McMahon, Jonathan Holt, Jo Handelsman and Kenneth F Raffa BMC Biology 2009, 7:11 ("**Broderick et al (2009)**") |
| 78. | *"Effects of infection with Nosema pyrausta on survival and development of offspring of laboratory selected Bt-resistant and Bt-susceptible European corn borers"*, M.D. Lopez, D. V. Sumerford, L. C. Lewis, Journal of Invertebrate Pathology 105 (2010) 248–253 ("**Lopez et al, (2010)**") |
| 79. | *"Avidin, a potential biopesticide and synergist to Bacillus thuringiensis toxins against field crop insects"*, Y.C. Zhu, J.J. Adamczyk Jr, S. West Southern Insect Management Research Unit, J Econ Entomol. 2005 Oct; 98(5):1566-71, Abstract only, ("**Zhu et al, (2005)**") |
| 80. | *"Synergistic effect of synthetic pyrethroids on the toxicity of Bacillus thuringiensis as shown by the biochemical changes in the sixth instar larvae of Tribolium castaneum"*, M. A. Saleem, N. Tufail, A. R. Shakoori, Pakistan Journal of Zoology [PAK. J. ZOOL.]. Vol. 27, no. 4, pp. 317-323. 1995 (Abstract Only) ("**Saleem et al, (1995)**") |
| 81. | *"Genetic Transformation of Crops for Insect Resistance: Potential and Limitations"*, H.C. Sharma, K.K. Sharma, J.H. Crouch, Critical Reviews in Plant Sciences, 23(1):47-72 (2004) ("**Sharma et al, (2004)**") |
| 82. | *"The Interactions between Soybean Trypsin Inhibitor and d-Endotoxin of Bacillus thuringiensis in Helicoverpa armigera Larva"*, J. Zhang, C. Wang, J. Qin, Journal |

| | |
|---|---|
| | of Invertebrate Pathology **75,** 259–266 (2000) (“**Zhang et al, (2000)**”) |
| 83. | *“Risk assessment of toxins derived from Bacillus thuringiensis—synergism, efficacy, and selectivity”,* C. Then, Environ Sci Pollut Res (“**Then, (2009)**”) |

**AUTHORITIES (“AU”)**

| TAB | DOCUMENT |
|---|---|
| 1. | Regulation (EC) No 1289/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 September 2003 on genetically modified food and feed (“**the GM Regulation**”) |
| 2. | Directive 2001/18/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 March 2001 on the deliberate release into the environment of genetically modified organisms and repealing Council Directive 90/220/EEC |
| 3. | Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety (“**the Food Safety regulation**”). |
| 4. | Case T-475/07 *Dow AgroSciences Ltd v Commission*, judgment of 9 September 2011 |
| 5. | Case T-13/99 *Pfizer Animal Health v Council* [2002] ECR II-3305 |
| 6. | Case T-70/99 *Alpharma v Council* [2002] ECR II-3495 |
| 7. | Case C-236/01 *Monsanto Agricoltura SpA* [2003] ECR I-8195 |
| 8. | Case T-326/07 *Cheminova v Commission* [2009] ECR II-2685 |
| 9. | Joined Cases C-189/02 P, C-205/02 P, C-208/02 P and 213/02 P *Dansk Rørindustri A/S and Others v Commission* [2005] ECR I-5425 |
| 10. | Guidance Document of the Scientific Panel on Genetically Modified Organisms for the Risk Assessment of Genetically Modified Plants and Derived Food and Feed, adopted on 24 September 2004, final edited version of 28 April 2006 (**“the Risk Assessment Guidance**”) |
| 11. | Guidance Document of the Scientific Panel on Genetically Modified Organisms for the risk assessment of genetically modified plants containing stacked transformation events, adopted on 16 May 2007 **(“the Stacked Event Guidance”)** |
| 12. | Scientific Opinion on the assessment of allergenicity of GM plants and microorganisms and derived food and feed<br>EFSA Panel on Genetically Modified Organisms (GMO Panel) EFSA Journal 2010; 8(7):1700 (“**the Allergenicity Opinion**”) |
| 13. | Scientific Opinion, Guidance for risk assessment of food and feed from genetically modified plants (“**the 2011 Guidance**”) |